VISITORS’ REPORT

Carthage College
Kenosha, WI
April 23-24, 2003

Richard Sjoerdsma
CHAIRPERSON

Catherine Hendel, BVM
Clarke College, Chair

Lynn Wheeler
Pacific Union College, Team Member

BA in Music
BM in Music Education
We would like to express our appreciation for the warm welcome and gracious hospitality we received during our visit to Carthage College. The spirit of the institution was clearly evident and the dedication of the faculty, students, staff and administration are to be commended.

"The following report and any statements therein regarding compliance with NASM accreditation standards represent only the considered opinion of the visitors at the time of the visit. Definitive evaluation of compliance and the accreditation decision will be made by the appropriate Commission following a complete review of the application, including the Self-Study, the Visitors Report, and any Optional Response to the Visitors’ Report submitted by the institution."

A. Mission Goals and Objective

The mission statement of Carthage College and its music unit are clearly articulated and demonstrate consistency of purpose (SS, Appendix A, p. 1-2). The goals of the music unit, with one exception, flow from its mission and thoroughly express its aspirations. While goal three appropriately identifies the professional nature of the B.A. in Music Education, it also includes “performance” as part of the BA degree. The college catalog states “a music major that elects to work toward professional competence... may do so by completing an emphasis in Performance, Church Music or Piano Pedagogy (CC. p. 43). It appeared to the visitors that the institution views these “emphases” as “elective studies” in the liberal arts degree and not the professional degree implied in published statements (HB II. J. p. 67). Consequently the intent of the degree as stated in the goals and elsewhere is confusing and requires clarification.

The objectives of the Music unit were developed in 1989 and appeared in the 1992 Self-Study (SS, Table 1). There is no indication that these were refined or modified for the 2003 Self-Study; moreover, they appear to replicate the goals stated in the current Self-Study (SS, Appendix A). No other objectives or outcomes are apparent in the Self-Study or other institutional or departmental documents. It will be important for the music faculty to clearly articulate specific, measurable objectives as a means to better focus its programs, to communicate its purposes in recruitment, and to engage in assessment that leads to confirmation or modification of its curriculum and other programmatic aspects (HB. II. A. pp 58-59).

The visitors were informed that the entire college community was currently engaged in on-going development of outcomes-based syllabi. These were not yet available during the visit. From the excellent teaching observed, it would seem that the faculty know what objectives they desire their students to achieve, however the outcomes do not appear to have been stated in syllabi or other printed information. It may be helpful to the music faculty—full-time, part-time, and adjunct—to participate in a
professional development workshop that both informs and provides practical assistance for creating outcomes for the music program, each curricular offering, and other supporting student activities (HB. II, A. p. 59).

B. Size and Scope
The music unit is to be commended on its excellent recruitment progress that was clearly apparent in classes observed. There was not only suitable numbers in the music B.A. core, but also a collegial environment and exchange among students and with faculty that emphasized the benefits of these efforts.

Some of the program’s “emphases” have low enrollments: piano pedagogy, composition, music theory, music theatre, and church music. While departmental enrollment is growing, it will be important to assure students that there is sufficient enrollment in each emphasis to support student learning (HB. II, B. p. 59). Further complicating this issue is that in the listing of Fall 2002 majors and minors (SS. Table III) and the Spring 2003 majors and minors provided for the visitors include composition and music theory as “emphases” when, in fact, they are not listed among the specific programs in the Self-Study (p. 28), in the music section of the college catalog, or among the curricular tables (SS. Appendix 4). In the student listing the acronym for the new music theatre emphasis described in the Self-Study (p. 29) is MT, the same as the one used for music theory. Thus it was difficult to identify the number of students in the new program. It is essential that program titles are clear, accurate and consistent with the content of the accredited program (HB. II, J. p. 67).

There appears to be sufficient full-time, part-time, and adjunct faculty to serve the needs of the music students. As retirement approaches for some faculty, the music faculty needs to engage in careful planning for replacement of full-time faculty that will provide both depth and breadth of musical knowledge and performance skills to effectively deliver its music programs. There appears to be sufficient advanced courses for each program as well as opportunities for advanced ensemble experience.

C. Finances
The annual budget appears adequate to support the music unit’s purposes. The music executive is provided with extensive latitude in allocating expenditures in this budget. Furthermore, the music unit has excellent scholarship offerings, and benefits regularly from local fund-raising and gift resources. The administration should be commended for its thorough-going support of the music unit.

D. Governance and Administration

1. Overall Effectiveness. Carthage College has had a long history at several locations in Wisconsin and Illinois since its founding in 1847. Now it appears to be on a very stable foundation in its current location. President Campbell came to Carthage in 1987 and together with Vice President for Academic Affairs, Kurt
Piepenburg, they have advanced their vision of the college as a liberal arts institution placing nearly equal stress upon (1) a core of studies including many disciplines, (2) a strong curriculum in a major, and (3) a fairly large number of free elective hours. They show genuine interest in the music department as well as the direction in which it is headed. Their support is evident in the recent hiring of two new music faculty members and the change in status of several more teachers from adjuncts to full-time teachers.

Richard Sjoerdsmma came to Carthage in 1968 to chair the music department. He is currently in his seventh year as chairman “this time around” after having taken a ten-year hiatus from that position. Continuity and stability are indicated by the long terms of these administrators. At the same time they all appear to be planning for the future and eventual retirements by having as a likely goal the search for a theorist and music technology expert.

2. Policy-Making. There is a strong sense of collegiality among the music faculty members. They appear to be very satisfied with how decisions are made within the department and with the amount of input they have in making those decisions. The music department’s faculty meet on a regular basis once a month, and they also meet once a month with the entire Fine Arts Division (Art, History of the Arts, Music, and Theatre and Communication) faculty. While procedures regarding promotions and tenure are clearly outlined in the Faculty Handbook, there was some confusion expressed about details in the process by newer and non-tenure track faculty. In explaining why only half of the full-time faculty members were tenured or on tenure track, the faculty stated that at Carthage College only those who have completed terminal degrees are eligible to enter those positions. All of the faculty support the idea of offering only Bachelor of Arts degrees and want even the professional degree in music education to continue being designated as a Bachelor of Arts in Music Education.

3. Music Executive’s Load and Responsibilities. The chair stated that he used to receive only two credits per semester for his duties as chair, but recently the credit has been raised to four credits in music and an equal amount for chairing the Fine Arts Division. Load credit for private lessons was shown to be in line with NASM’s 2:3 ratio (Standard II.E.4) when it was explained that lessons are 45 minutes long. The chair appears to be genuinely respected and appreciated by all students and faculty. Under his leadership the department has grown remarkably. He has many innovative ideas and has nurtured many relationships in the college and community to the benefit of the department. Although approaching retirement, he remains enterprising and stated that he hopes to continue for at least another couple years.

4. Communication. Communication among the various components of the music unit and the Fine Arts Division seems very good because the music chair is also the division chair. Music faculty members have been involved in various
governing committees for the entire campus, and it appears that communication through the department chair is excellent with the upper level administrators.

E. Faculty and Staff

The ten full-time faculty members are well prepared for their positions and exhibited exceptional teaching skills. In all of the classes observed the students were enthusiastically engaged in the learning process. Because of scheduling conflicts, the visitors were unable to observe an upper-level music history course. This was especially unfortunate because later students expressed concerns about how many hours are required in history courses and about the amount of overlapping content that exists between various courses.

Almost all of the adjunct faculty members also appear to be well qualified for their duties. However the visitors expressed concern to the department chair that those holding less than a master’s degree teaching courses in theoretical, historical, or pedagogical subjects might not be sufficiently prepared. (HB. II. E. 1. p. 61; VIII. P. 85). Also establishing a salary scale for adjunct faculty might avert future misunderstandings.

Students who study their primary instrument with adjunct faculty are assigned to full-time teachers in closely related instruments for purposes of advising. The teachers and students appear to be satisfied with this arrangement, and the advisors do not appear to be overburdened by it.

The very high morale of the faculty has apparently resulted from he recent growth in numbers of students and perceived quality of the programs offered. Faculty loads generally adhere to the twelve-hour standard per semester or average out to that standard.

The college and department are to be commended for recently hiring two new young, energetic teachers for band/music education and for choral/organ positions. These two new teachers have already shown results in recruitment efforts and should continue to be positive influences in the department for many years to come.

F. Facilities, Equipment, and Safety

At the present time facilities appear to be adequate for the size and scope of the department. The visitors were assured that safety concerns about lighting in a practice room (Room 248), blown bulbs in two exit lights, and broken cement at the threshold of one entry door will be readily repaired (HB.II.F. p.64). The Self-Study mentioned that temperature and humidity was difficult to control, and the visitors noted the validity of this concern. Even though the weather was sunny and moderate during the visit, some rooms were uncomfortably cool while at the same time others were much too warm. This was especially apparent during the Carthage Choir rehearsal in the
choral room when the room was very humid and warm when the fifty-two students were singing (HB. II. F. p. 64).

If growth continues as currently planned, the department could quickly outgrow its facilities for practice rooms. There are several factors involved including: 1) Practice rooms are the only place for some adjuncts to teach; 2) sound transfer between rooms is serious enough so that adjacent practice rooms cannot be used during lessons; and 3) teachers expressed concerns that many students need to spend more time practicing than they are doing presently (HB. II.F. p. 64).

Carthage College can be proud of their beautiful A. F. Siebert Chapel. This facility is connected on its south side to the Johnson Arts Center (including the music department), and on its north side to the Hedberg Library. Upon entering the front doors of the chapel, one is impressed by the magnificent four manual, 63 rank tracker action Cassavant organ. It was a pleasure for the visitors to hear this fine instrument played by a music major performing Toccata on the Old Hundredth Psalm Tune by Michael Burkhardt (his teacher) at the student recital. The chapel’s design has a large enough performing area to accommodate large ensembles (such as the college band heard in rehearsal with a piano soloist) while also offering an intimate enough feeling for small ensembles or individual soloists (as demonstrated in the student recital). Humidity and temperature control also affect the instruments to their detriment. Faculty explained that wide fluctuations of temperature in the chapel are adversely affecting the very expensive organ. Even more obvious is the effect lack of climate control is having upon the pianos. The visitors were assured that instruments are tuned several times a year, but it was discovered that many octaves in the highest and lowest registers on some pianos sounded like sevenths, and the unison tunings even in the middle ranges were very discordant on several practice pianos as well as on the grand piano in the band room. Purchase of new pianos apparently will not solve many problems with the pianos until the humidity and temperature can be controlled more effectively (HB. II. F. p. 64). The department’s location within feet of Lake Michigan makes control of humidity a special concern.

The music and art departments share the same hallways, and at one time the visitors became aware of a very strong chemical smell. This could pose serious health problems for students suffering from asthma or for vocalists who are being trained to breathe deeply in order to sing correctly. It might also be an OSHA concern (HB. II. F. p. 64)

The visitors did not observe any technology being utilized in the classrooms during their stay other than sound reproduction on stereo systems. Although the library has computers available for student use, there was no observed use of modern technology in teaching. There are twelve electronic pianos and a teacher’s console in one classroom used for keyboarding classes. There were also about five small synthesizers connected to some fairly old computers in one very small room, but no students were ever observed actually using any of that equipment. It was unclear to
the visitors if this observation revealed problems with the technology itself (HB II. F. p.64); curricular content that does not employ technology (HB. VII. E. p. 84); faculty comfort with the use of technology in teaching (HB. II. E. 1. p. 61) or some other factor. As the faculty engage in development of outcomes for coursework, appropriate integration of technology will be essential, especially in the BA in Music Education.

G. Library

Since the newly constructed Hedberg Library is attached to the same building complex that houses the music department, library use has become much more convenient for music faculty and students than when it was located farther south on campus. According to the librarian, there is excellent use of the library holdings—on average approximately 10% of music books and 30% of music videos are checked out at any one time.

Information about items held in the library is available on line, and many periodicals are also available to students and faculty on line. Annual appropriations have averaged about $5,000 per year for books and $2,000 per year for non-print materials during the past several years. Computers, projectors, video players, microfilm readers, etc. are located near the holdings and are available for students’ use. There are open stacks for all materials (even including the compact disks) so students and faculty can browse through the holdings.

The music faculty members are encouraged to request materials they want and/or need for classes, and the librarian gave assurance that all such requests are filled as quickly as possible. While the library’s current music holdings were not included in the Self-Study (p. 14 or Appendix H), this library appears to be well maintained and has holdings sufficient for a liberal arts college with the size and scope of Carthage College. The only area that might be lacking is in current periodicals pertaining to specialties offered (HB. II. G. 2. p. 65). An example of this lack was that the visitor could not find a journal dealing with choral music such as the Choral Journal in either the stacks or on line.

H. Recruitment, Admission-Retention, Record-Keeping, and Advisement

Carthage College music unit has been highly successful in recruiting new students and increasing enrollment from 62 to 83 students within three years (SS Appendix I). The ensemble directors and the music executive have engaged assertive efforts to attract qualified students for the music programs at Carthage College. Specific procedures are not listed per se. It may be helpful to articulate the specific strategies used so that their effectiveness can be assessed for the purpose of on-going improvement and continued successful recruiting.
The recruitment materials are attractive and obviously effective. The reply card that is part of the primary recruitment brochure for the music unit contains some inconsistencies. The title of “piano certification” in one portion whereas “piano pedagogy” is listed on the first page of the same publication. These two listings are quite different in nature and may well confuse prospective students. The Scholarship amounts are listed and enumerated. Actually the number of scholarships given at the different amounts is more than what is indicated. It may be more accurate to indicate the range of awards rather than numbers that are incorrect (HB. II. J. p. 67).

While this music department is demonstrating a substantive growth rate, no retention statistics were available in the Self-Study. The faculty plays an important role in the student satisfaction and evidently has been successful. However, no specific procedures or strategies for retaining students in the department and/or college have been articulated. Departmental lists indicate that Fall, 2002 had 80 majors/7 minors; in Spring 2003 the enrollment was 73 majors and 10 minors. These positive statistics indicate that retention activities most likely occur, but it is unclear if such practices are defined, published for students and applied with rigor and fairness (HB. II. H. p. 66).

The Self Study suggests that a departmental plan to maintain documents: e.g., recital programs; audio/video tapes of performances, research projects, student portfolios (p. 16). During the visit the files did not reveal consistency and tapes were not available. Student portfolios were not available for review because this assessment procedure is still quite new at Carthage College and in the music unit. It appears that the department has initiated a plan for record-keeping during the Self-Study process, it will be important for the unit to implement its plan thoroughly and include the results of various assessments in student file (HB. II. H. p. 66).

In addition to full-time advising, several of the full-time faculty act as liaisons between adjunct and student musicians. This appears to be a highly effective arrangement and clearly a beneficial retention strategy. There was some indication that a number of the newly recruited students are unsure of the possible career opportunities for which a major in music prepares them. The music unit may wish to initiate career exploration earlier in the students’ collegiate experience; starting the portfolio prior to the senior year may also assist in directing students in developing their academic and career goals.

It appears that the procedures outlined in the student handbook are consistently implemented and applied with rigor and fairness.

J. Published Materials

The Carthage College publications are visually attractive and the announcement piece of the new faculty is delightfully creative. The mission, goals, and objectives, however, are not included in the College Catalog and Music Student Handbook. The catalog (pp. 43-44) and recruitment brochures also have inconsistencies and some errors (HB. II. J. p. 67). Some of these inaccuracies are simple numeric or spelling corrections, while others
relate to basic purpose of the degrees, e.g., B.A. emphases are described as providing "professional competence (CC. p. 42). This description requires the music unit to clarify its intent of offering the BA with limited electives—thus, an emphasis; or the BM with the extensive curriculum that prepares students for professional level competence. Once this decision is made, then all publications need to be consistent in the way that they accurately reflect Carthage College Music programs.

The visitors reviewed the inaccuracies with the chairperson who indicated that corrections will be forthcoming in the catalog. It will be important for the music unit to review all of its publications to ensure accuracy and consistency relative to program titles, curriculum, policies and procedures of the Carthage Music Department (HB. I. 7& 8, p. 57).

The Curricular Charts (SS. Appendix IV) for the BA in Music with emphases in Church Music, Performance, and Music Theatre indicate these are four-year degrees. On one hand if the students take the minimum number of credits (138) in the BA in Church Music or Performance, then it is possible to complete the degree in four years with no additional cost. On the other hand, if the students choose to take courses that approximate the 150 to 154 credits, these programs cannot be completed in four years without additional cost of overload credit for the student (CC. p. 10). The music unit will need to decide if it wishes to modify its published information about the length of these programs or limit the course work to the 138 institutional credit requirement for graduation (CC. p.9).

The recruitment brochure includes a detailed list of the monetary amount of the scholarship opportunities. The visitors were informed that frequently more scholarship aid is awarded. Since this increase occurs regularly it may be more accurate to indicate the range of awards rather than numbers that are incorrect (HB II. J. p. 67).

K. Branch Campuses, External Programs, Use of the Institution's Name for Education Activities Operated Apart from the Main Campus or the Primary Education Program

NA

L. Community Involvement and Articulation with Other Schools

A positive interaction and collaboration exist with the Racine Symphony and Kenosha Symphony; local schools and churches. Such involvement and exchange clearly serves the College and Civic community well.

M. Non-Degree-Granting Programs for the Community.

The piano preparatory program is a positive means of community service for the music unit of Carthage College. Since it has neither a budget nor director, it should not be listed in the NASM directory.
O. PROGRAMS, DEGREES AND CURRICULA

1. Specific Curricula

Bachelor of Arts in Music

The curriculum for the BA in Music, “Core Major,” appears to achieve threshold compliance with the NASM standards for the liberal arts degree with a major in music (HB. VI. p. 81). It was unclear to the visitors if the specific emphases, when added to the core major of the programs, continue to meet the NASM threshold competencies for the BA degree. There were several articulated inconsistencies and published inaccuracies that made it difficult to ascertain what the music unit truly desires in its programs. These concerns described below will need to be addressed so that an accurate assessment can be made about each program.

The Self-Study identifies four areas of emphases that require additional coursework: “Performance, Piano Pedagogy, Church Music, and Music Theatre” (SS. p. 28-29). The Bachelor of Arts with a major in music indicates the study of music in a liberal arts degree framework (HB. VI. p. 81). The description of the performance emphasis given in the narrative (SS. p. 28, CC. p. 42) more closely approximates the professional degree (HB. VIII. p. 85; A. p. 86); while the curricular table (SS. Appendix IV) is within keeping with the liberal arts focus (HB VI. p. 81). The B. A. with emphasis in Church Music is described as “in line with the percentages stated in NASM’s guidelines for a B.M. in Sacred Music (SS. p. 28). The curricular chart for this emphasis indicates a wide range of credits for performance creating additional confusion regarding the nature of this program (HB. VIII. E. p. 90). Similarly, the new B.A. with emphasis in Musical Theatre is described as “structured according to the NASM guidelines for that major.” It is unclear if the music unit is describing the BA or the BM (HB. p. 173). The music unit needs to review these programs, clearly articulate the desired intent, and make the modifications in curriculum and titles that will reflect the appropriate NASM standards—liberal arts or professional—for each emphasis or degree. In this way the institution can maintain the integrity of degree types and titles (HB. IV. P. 77).

The Emphasis in Piano Pedagogy has evolved from a certificate program and is now considered a “regular Emphasis for Carthage students” (SS. p28). This emphasis, however, has no curricular chart (SS. Appendix IV). The music unit needs to address curricular requirements and the degree title that best serves the needs of Carthage students (HB. IV. p. 77) and then include it accurately and consistently in all of its publications.
Bachelor of Arts in Music Education

Carthage College Music Department offers three areas of emphasis within B.A. in Music Education: General Music, Choral Music, and Instrumental Music. The enrollment in these programs is very good, and there appears to be a positive working relationship with the schools in the region that service the various pre-professional field experiences. These programs appear to meet threshold compliance with NASM standards for the profession degree in music education with following exceptions.

It is not clear how the following competencies are met in the general music education and choral degrees:

a. Orchestration: MUSI 312 is not listed as required for the general or choral music emphases (CC.43; SS., Appendix IV), the Self-Study (p. 25) describes how “orchestration” serves these emphases, but it does not list it as required (HB. VII. B p. 83). Consequently, it is not clear how the students gain this competency.

b. Technology: The visitors saw little evidence of the ways in which music education students developed a basic overview understanding how technology serves the field or a working knowledge of technology as applicable to the field of education (HB. VII.E.1, 2 p. 84).

c. Performance: There was not evidence that students in music education and other emphases demonstrate the technical skills requisite for artistic self-expression in at least one major performance area at a level appropriate for the particular music concentration (HB. VII. A.1, p. 83).

d. The curricular table for the BA in Music with an emphasis in instrumental music education appears to have mistakenly listed the requisites for the choral program. A corrected table should be submitted to demonstrate that students gain sufficient knowledge and skills to work as a leader and in collaboration on musical matters of interpretation (HB.VII. A. 4. p. 83).

e. Sufficient laboratory experiences that give students opportunities to apply rehearsal techniques and procedures were not apparent. The course MUSI 320 Field Experience is offered for 0 credit and the nature of the experience as described the college catalog (p. 47) is not clear (HB. VIII. J.3 b.5 d, p. 96).

f. Rudimentary capacity to create derivative or original music both extemporaneously and in written form. The SS narrative (p.25-26) describes the ways in which composition and improvisational skills are delivered. However, the required courses for the general music emphasis are not included in those that provide compositional skills. This competency applies to the choral emphasis as well, but is not mentioned in the narrative. (HB. VII.C. 1-2, p. 84).
2. Study of the Transcripts of Recent Graduates and Comparison with Catalogue Statements.

Several student transcripts were examined and were found to have fulfilled the requirements outlined in the College Catalog. Discrepancies in number of hours listed in the College Catalog on pages 43 and 44 were explained and will be corrected in the next edition. Those changes include on page 43: MUSI 314 Learning About Instruments actually replaces courses 205-208; Total additional music credits in the Choral Music Education Emphasis is actually 21, in the General Music Education Emphasis is actually 18, and in the Church Music Emphasis is actually 22. On page 44 the course MUSI 311 Choral Conducting and Techniques is actually offered for 4 credits making the total addition credits in the Performance Emphasis 18-20. The omission of MUSI 307 Music History III from recent transcripts was explained by the chairman as a new requirement that was not yet required of those students.

The new catalog will also need to address the nature of each curricular offering and make the appropriate modifications that the music unit decides upon.


Students at Carthage College appear to be dedicated to the department and enjoy their studies. The department has instituted a new requirement for student portfolios this year, but so far none of these were available for the visitors to peruse. Student performances in the recital were of a very acceptable quality for students in B.A. and music education programs.


The location of Carthage College between Chicago and Milwaukee offers many opportunities for students to attend many professional performances. The college also brings fine performances to the campus including performances by local symphonies with college vocal ensembles. There are nearly weekly student recitals, and faculty recitals were included in the program booklets examined by the visitors. In addition the Carthage Choir has always gone on extended tours, and the band also did a tour this spring. Performances on campus are open to students from all majors, and attendance at some is required of students in the music appreciation courses. It appears that Carthage College offers more than the average number of performance opportunities on campus for a school of its size and scope.

5. Music Studies for the General Public

Non-music majors can take the Exploring Music course (MUSI 115) to fulfill a humanities course requirement. Many non-music majors also take private lessons and participate in the various music ensembles. The Exploring Music course the visitors were able to observe was taught by a tenure track teacher who appeared to be thoroughly enjoying teaching the course and had the rapt attention of the 21 students in attendance. Because non-majors get to choose one course in the fine arts from
several different departments, it might benefit the departments—as well as the students—to explore offering an interdisciplinary fine arts course.

P. Music Unit Evaluation, Planning, and Projections

During the Self-study process, many issues were studied, reviewed and positive action taken. The recruitment efforts and enrollment growth are clear indicators of such successful planning. In examining the Self-study and discussions with the music unit it became apparent to the visitors that some procedures and policies that are effective have not been articulated specifically in writing. Consequently, when examining the operational activities of the music unit for purposes of future planning and projections, it was extremely difficult to identify which endeavors would be most beneficial. Furthermore, it was unclear if any internal assessment of student outcomes occurs.

The entire Carthage College community has been working to develop competency-based outcomes for all of its programs and courses. For the most part, current syllabi in the music unit have yet to employ this model. Once the faculty have determined and articulated departmental outcomes/objectives that reflect its mission and goals, the task of developing course outcomes should be easier.

Q. Standards Summary

It is unclear as to how the institution addresses the following threshold standards:

1. Department and program mission, goals and objectives; student outcomes; and other programmatic information are articulated clearly, accurately and consistently in the appropriate publication (HB. II. A. pp 58-59; HB II. J. p. 67).
2. Program titles are clear, accurate and consistent with the content of the accredited program (HB. II. J. p. 67).
3. Sufficient enrollment in each emphasis to support student learning (HB. II. B. p. 59).
4. Sufficiently prepared faculty with less than a master's degree teaching courses in theoretical, historical, or pedagogical subjects (HB. II. E. 1. p. 61; VIII. P. 85).
5. Sufficient space for student practice (HB. II.F. p. 64).
6. Humidity and temperature control more effectively (HB. II. F. p. 64).
7. Safety of space shared with Art Department HB. II. F. p. 64.
8. Sufficient resources (HB II. F. p.64), curricular content in technology (HB. VII. E. p. 84), and faculty training in technology (HB. II. E. 1. p. 61).
10. Retention practices that are defined and published for students and applied with rigor and fairness (HB. II. H. p. 66).
11. Record-keeping that includes the results of significant assessments in student file (HB. II. H. p. 66).

12. Consistency and accuracy in catalog copy (pp. 43-44), recruitment brochures and all publications (HB. II. J. p. 67; HB. I. 7& 8, p. 57). Specific course requirements for music education and other music programs are not clearly listed and made available to students.

13. Clarity of desired intent in curriculum and titles that will reflect the appropriate NASM standards—liberal arts or professional—for each emphasis or degree. In this way the institution can maintain the integrity of degree types and titles (HB. IV. P. 77).

a. Performance emphasis (SS. p. 28, CC. p. 42) more closely approximates the professional degree (HB. VIII, p. 85; A. p. 86).

b. Emphasis in Church Music: confusion regarding the nature of this program (HB. VIII. E. p. 90).

c. Emphasis in Musical Theatre: unclear if BA or the BM is the desired/proposed degree (HB. p. 173).

14. It is not clear how the following competencies in the music education program are being met:

a. Orchestration in the general and choral emphases (HB. VII. B p. 83).

b. Technology in all three areas (HB. VII.E.1, 2 p. 84).

c. Sufficient conducting that enables students in instrumental emphasis with sufficient knowledge and skills to work as a leader and in collaboration on musical matters of interpretation (HB.VII. A. 4, p. 83).

d. Sufficient laboratory experiences that give students opportunities to apply rehearsal techniques and procedures (HB. VIII. J.3 b.5 d, p. 96).

e. Rudimentary capacity to create derivative or original music both extemporaneously and in written form (HB. VII.C. 1-2, p. 84).

f. Demonstration of the technical skills requisite for artistic self-expression in at least one major performance area at a level appropriate for the particular music concentration (HB. VII. A.1, p. 83).

R. Overview, Summary Assessment, and Recommendations

Catholic College Music Department is experiencing a renewed growth in enrollment and new faculty while retaining many of the traditions of this institution. Among the strengths revealed during the visit are:

1. The excellent faculty of artists/teachers who are collaborative, dedicated problem solvers, hard-working. Their teaching exudes enthusiasm for their subject area and engages students in active learning.

2. Significant growth in the department—recruitment and retention of students appears to be highly successful.

3. Tremendous support of the administration: financial, operational budget and scholarships; new faculty and other resources.

4. The chapel space offers state of the art organ and fine performance venue.
5. Excellent new library that is in close proximity to the music unit appears to be effectively utilized by faculty and students.
6. Creative, effective collaboration of FT liaisons with adjuncts.
7. Students are provided with extensive opportunities for performance and participation in planning for the music unit.

**Areas for improvement:**

1. Students stretched by too many majors, minors, emphases, and participation in ensembles, and secondary lessons.
2. The extensive nature of the music education degree is well-known and documented at Carthage College—and for that matter in most music units. The stress placed on second majors, additional emphases and minors, however, appears to be distorting the institution’s intended “elective” component of Carthage College BA degrees. The large number of credits for the various emphases point to this concern.

**Recommendations:**

The visitors offer the following recommendations as possible means to address issues of compliance and enhance the future work of the music unit.
1. Articulate a FT faculty load formula; adjunct salary rates to achieve desired equity.
2. Explore alternative ways to provide accompaniment for students: e.g., clavinova; student accompanists and/or use of local piano teachers.
3. Ensure faculty in content areas have at least a masters degree.
4. Articulate the pedagogical, developmental principles that govern the selection of music literature in ensembles. In this way students are informed of the educational function and experience level of each performing group.
5. Explore grants to update and interface technology.
6. Increase communication/collaboration between music unit and college’s administrative offices: College relations office/admissions—tour planning and funding; conference and events for scheduling; registrar’s office for glitches in online registration of music students; course scheduling.
7. Explore possibility of an interdisciplinary fine arts general education offering.
8. Investigate ways to address sound seepage in practice rooms. While the number of rooms appeared to be adequate at this time; adjuncts using these rooms for instruction may have an adverse effect on student practice.
9. Examine and update the curricular offerings in the music education programs; this may include careful review of education requirements offered by the music unit and reading in the content area. Are these DPI requirements that stipulate competencies or stand-alone courses? If only competencies, then realignment may be desirable.
10. Engage in dialogue about the intent of the emphases in the BA. Once the unit and the institution decide, then make the necessary modifications or additions to more accurately reflect the programs.

11. The music unit may wish to eliminate some of its emphases that have lower enrollments; and discontinue adding or naming emphases that are not included in the articulated programs.

12. Establish a long-range plan for piano maintenance, restoration, and purchase.

13. Prepare a plan to replace faculty who will be retiring in the near future.